MINUTES DEKALB COUNTY PLAN COMMISSION Wednesday January 15, 2025

The Regular Meeting of the DeKalb County Plan Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. in the DeKalb County Commissioner's Courtroom by Plan Commission President, Jason Carnahan

ROLL CALL:

Members Present: Jason Carnahan, William Van Wye, William Hartman, Tyler Lanning, Suzanne Davis, Angie Holt, Sandra Harrison, Jerry Yoder and Frank Pulver

Members Absent: Elysia Rodgers

<u>Staff Present:</u> Plan Commission Attorney Andrew Kruse, Director/Zoning Administrator Chris Gaumer, and Secretary Meredith Reith

Community Representatives Present: Mike Makarewich

Public in Attendance: Carlyle Holman, Jason Holman, and Jared Malcolm

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

Jason Carnahan led The Pledge of Allegiance.

PRAYER:

Jerry Yoder led in prayer.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

Motion made by Frank Pulver to nominate Jason Carnahan as President with Angie Holt seconding the motion. Suzanne Davis then motioned to close the nominations. Seconded by Jason Carnahan. None opposed. Motion carried.

Motion made by William Hartman to nominate William Van Wye as Vice-President with Jason Carnahan seconding the motion. Suzanne Davis motioned to close nominations. Seconded by Jason Carnahan. None opposed. Motion carried.

Motion made by William Van Wye to appoint Meredith Reith as Secretary with Jerry Yoder seconding the motion. None opposed. Motion carried.

CITY AND TOWN REPRESENTATIVES:

Mr. Gaumer stated that we can retain the current members.

Sandra Harrison - Hamilton and Butler

Frank Pulver/ William Hartman - Garrett

William Van Wye – Ashley

Suzanne Davis- Auburn

Angie Holt- Waterloo

Mrs. Holt motioned to retain the current appointments seconded by Mr. Van Wye. None opposed. Motion carried.

BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS APPOINTMENT:

Mr. Van Wye motioned to retain the current appointment for the Board of Zoning Appeals member Jason Carnahan. Seconded by Tyler Lanning. None opposed. Motion carried.

By a unanimous vote Mrs. Holt was retained as the current Plan Commission alternate member of the Board of Zoning Appeals for Jason Carnahan. None opposed. Motion carried.

PLAT COMMITTEE APPOINMENTS:

Motion was made by Mr. Van Wye to retain the current members, Plan Commission members Elysia Rodgers, Sandra Harrison, Suzanne Davis, Jerry Yoder, and Jason Carnahan. Seconded by Mr. Lanning. None opposed. Motion carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Motioned by Mr. Carnahan to approve the November 20, 2024 meeting minutes. Seconded by Mrs. Holt. None opposed. Motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF CLAIMS:

Jason Carnahan inquired about any comments, questions, or motions to approve November and December 2024 claims, totaling \$81,210.19.

Mrs. Harrison motioned to approve claims seconded by Mrs. Davis. None opposed. Motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

Petition #25-03 – Arbor Wood Co., Jason Holman representative, requesting a Zone Map Amendment of approximately 10 acres from A2, Agricultural to I3, High Intensity Industrial. The property is located at 6878 County Road 62, St. Joe, Indiana

Mr. Gaumer addressed why the property needs to be rezoned, being zoned agricultural. It has been used in this similar type of use before. He briefly explained what Arbor Wood manufacturers. He added that the company is working with the Council to receive a tax abatement. He addressed that when the Council was reviewing the abatement form it asked if they complied with the zoning. With this property being zoned incorrectly it's considered a legal non-conforming use. The zoning didn't change back in 2009 when the UDO was created. He asked that they come before the Plan Commission and request a rezone to bring the property into compliance. He addressed that it's a legal non-conforming use. This means that they can expand the current use of the property but if they want to change anything substantial, they wouldn't be able to. The property needs to be following the UDO. He addressed the zoning located near the property. Having agricultural and industrial zoning located near this site. He read from the staff report what I3 allows, this will be a clean-up of the zoning that has been there for many years.

Mr. Van Wye stated that the Holman's have had business there before.

Mr. Gaumer asked Jason Holman to approach the podium and briefly explain the history of the property.

Jason Holman stated that Eco Vantage was started back in 2008, we have operated here since then. It was just recently when we sold it to Arbor Wood Co. He stated that when they first started it was like an agricultural process. He wasn't aware that the property needed to be rezoned. He explained what Arbor Wood manufacturers. We cook the lumber received to a high temperature which collapses the cells in the wood. This makes the wood water and rot resistant. Along with this it cooks the food source out. We're able to use these hard woods for siding, flooring, and decking to make it dimensionally stable. A lot of the wood goes out west. It's more fire resistant to be used in California. This process is done without chemicals. He stated that they are looking at putting in another kiln, to help the growth of the business.

Mr. Hartman asked what temperature you cook the wood at.

Mr. Holman stated we take it up to about 212 degrees Celsius which is around 420 degrees Fahrenheit for about 3 hours. There's a six-hour ramp up time and six-hour ramp down time in the higher heat range. It's probably 40 to 50 hours in the drying phase and 10 hours in the conditioning phase. The conditioning phase will bring moisture back to the wood. It's approximately 3 to 4 days for each semi load of wood that we push through.

Mr. Van Wye is there any chemicals or steam left when you do this.

Mr. Holman stated that there's not any chemicals. The only thing that would get cooked out is the sap and resins. We have trays in the kilns for this to get caught, most of it will crystallize. We have water that sprays the wood to cool it down and goes into settling tanks. This new kiln that we plan to have won't have smoke like the others did. If you're around the area you can smell smoke every 3 to 4 days. He stated that they plan to retro fit the old kilns with the same technology as the new ones. This will help to eliminate the smoke smell.

Mr. Yoder stated that it's a different smell. He can tell when the wind comes out of the northwest the kilns have been fired up. He asked if the 10 acres had been purchased by Arbor Woods.

Mr. Holman stated that they did purchase the building and the ground from Eco Vantage.

Mr. Yoder asked if the extra ground around will be used for expansion.

Mr. Holman stated that this is how Eco Vantage had it laid out. The area in the back is mostly woods. He stated that we could expand back there but he just doesn't know if we would. He showed where the new expansion would be. Located on the existing building to the front. He stated that as of right now they will be using the parcel purchased.

Mr. Pulver asked how many employees Mr. Holman had currently.

Mr. Holman stated that right now there're thirteen and I plan to add six to eight more employees. Most of our employees come from Inspiration Ministries. They have done great work for us.

Mrs. Holt asked how we originally got here. Did the original business qualify under the A2.

Mr. Gaumer stated that back in 2008 it would have been some sort of agricultural district under our old Master Plan. He assumed that they classified it as agricultural because it was just lumber.

Mr. Holman stated that the original use of the buildings was for welding and storing farm equipment. When we brought Eco Vantage in it was mostly lumber driven. With this it was under the ag district being farmers. He stated that at first it wasn't really manufacturing. Now we are starting to manufacture more lumber products.

Mrs. Holt addressed that it was more like a home-based enterprise.

Mr. Gaumer answered that this kind of was. It evolved over time and became bigger than what they expected. He stated that when he was watching Council this just wasn't meeting the UDO standards.

Mrs. Holt asked what was driving the I3 district. Is it necessary?

Mr. Gaumer stated that it's partially because I1 is not intense enough, allowing for warehouse distribution. In I2 it's more of just light manufacturing. With the definition being broad with this type. You could go less if you wanted to. The I2 only allowed for light manufacturing, assembly, and distribution. This business seemed more intense to him. He stated that this is why he requested heavy manufacturing. He questioned if this property would be the main office.

Mr. Holman stated that this would be the only manufacturing plant for our company. It was based out of Minnesota and the plant was closed when Eco Vantage was purchased. He addressed that because this is such a manufacturing community, it's easy to purchase parts and find good help. He added that he kind of talked them into moving everything down here in the Midwest.

Mr. Gaumer stated that he would read the definitions for light and heavy manufacturing to maybe help understand this better.

Mr. Pulver asked how many feet of board runs through his facility.

Mr. Holman stated that we roughly run about 150,000 board a foot. A semi load of wood is about 14,000 to 15,000 depending on the species.

Mr. Van Wye asked what the truck traffic was like on CR 62.

Mr. Holman stated that if we average it out it's probably a semi load a day. He addressed that it usually results in being busy for like two days out of the week with 2-3 semi loads. Then maybe not busy for two days. He stated that the kilns will average about 14 loads during a month. With two kilns that would average about 28 loads in one month. He stated that it's basically one semi load a day.

Mr. Hartman asked if the lumber must be stacked and slated before going into the kiln, is this what your help will do.

Mr. Holman stated that we must put sticks in every row. It will be placed on the sticking line when we bring it in. We put sticks between the lumber, and it gets pushed into the kiln.

Mr. Yoder asked what the percentage of hardwood to pine from the decking to siding that's being made.

Mr. Holman stated that we're doing more siding than decking. Mostly pine siding and some ash. We're pulling away from ash since being harder to get. Pushing more poplar and pine this year. He stated that the numbers before will be with the new kiln. The current number is only 14 loads a month. With the new kiln it will about double our capacity.

Mrs. Davis questioned if there were any objection letters.

Mr. Gaumer stated that there was one letter that came in. The letter was addressed from Carlyle Holman directly west of the proposed rezone. He stated that Carlyle Holman had concerns regarding the rezone. He attached pictures showing outdoor storage if fencing or buffers will be required. He addressed the drainage concerns and the truck traffic that will decline his property value.

Mr. Hartman asked what the address was again.

Mr. Gaumer stated that it was 6854 CR 62, the home immediately next door.

Mr. Van Wye questioned if the property north of 6854 is an open field.

Mr. Gaumer stated that it's owned by Westrick LLC. It was zoned this way back in 2009 when the zoning ordinance changed.

Mr. Van Wye asked what the lot was currently zoned.

Mr. Gaumer stated that it was I3.

Mrs. Davis asked Carlyle Holman to approach the podium if he wishes to comment.

Carlyle Holman approached the podium stating that he lives just on the northwest side of the plant. He stated that his complaints are that everything sets out right along the concrete next to him, owning up to the concrete. He addressed that when he owned the property there wasn't anything sitting out in front of the buildings. He stated that there's also more trucks parking along the drive. He disagrees with how many trucks there are but never counted the trucks coming in and out during the day. He addressed that CR 62 is very mudding. Mr. Yoder asked if he was speaking for or against this proposed project. Carlyle stated that he was against it.

Mr. Van Wye asked if CR 62 is a dirt road. Carlyle stated that it is.

Mr. Carnahan asked if there were any more questions for Mr. Holman.

Mr. Van Wye asked if these trucks are sitting overnight or during the day.

Mr. Holman stated that some of the trucks will pull in and sit overnight. They asked us when Eco Vantage was here and let them sit overnight before, vs a truck stop. He stated that he hasn't expanded at all since

Carlyle owned it a year ago. He addressed that they would have more wood outside until we get everything organized from the move. When Eco Vantage owned it, we did more custom treating. What that was is wood was brought into us we treated it. It was picked up and shipped right back to them. During that time, we didn't have as much wood lying around. He addressed as far as the truck traffic goes it really hasn't changed a lot.

Mr. Pulver questioned how far the driveway was from CR 62 and SR 101.

Mr. Holman stated that it's about a quarter mile.

Mr. Van Wye questioned how wide the driveway was.

Mr. Holman stated that it's 24 feet. What we normally do is if we have a truck's there overnight, they stay on one side of the driveway.

Mrs. Davis asked if there was a possibility that evergreen trees be planted to screen Carlyle's property, so it doesn't reduce his property value and help to block the view.

Mr. Holman stated that they would be open to trying to do something. He addressed that the property line is basically the driveway. He stated that we would have to do this on his property.

Mr. Gaumer stated that the Plan Commission can't require someone to put landscaping on someone's property. You would have to buy 20 feet of property to put that landscaping in.

Mr. Holman stated that he knows that his company is interested in buying their property at some point. As of right now we're trying to get the business going.

Mr. Gaumer asked so it looks like the driveway from Carlyle's is connected.

Mr. Holman stated that it does. He has an existing driveway that connects to are concrete driveway. He stated that Carlyle was one of the owners before we sold. He would use the driveway to drive back and forth from the plant.

Mr. Gaumer asked if he was an owner of Eco Vantage. So, he's just against this project.

Mr. Holman stated that he was. He addressed that maybe he's just not aware of the zoning. He added that he was unaware of these concerns happening.

Mr. Van Wye addressed if much was stored outside.

Mr. Holman stated we do store quite a bit of wood outside right now. We're trying to get through our warehouse. We're looking at putting up a hoop building to store wood out back.

Mr. Gaumer stated that the I3 allows for open use and outdoor storage. He addressed that the I2 only allows for light manufacturing. Back to Mrs. Holt's original question about light manufacturing. It's a process that ordinarily doesn't create noise, smoke, fumes, odors, glare, or health safety concerns outside the building or lot. Where such assembly or processing of goods are housed entirely inside the housed building. The light manufacturing generally includes processing and fabrication of finished products predominately from previously prepared materials. He briefly explained I3, the assembly, fabrication, or processing of goods and materials using processes that ordinally have greater or minimal impacts on the environment. Which may include open uses and outdoor storage. The heavy manufacturing generally includes processing and fabrication of products made from extracted or raw materials. He addressed that you could see the difference as far as what constitutes heavy vs light.

Mr. Pulver stated that some of the major headbutting points are outdoor storage and the distance from your driveway to 101. He asked if there was a possibility that you would put up some sort of storage.

Mr. Holman stated that they plan on adding a generic style hoop building to the back to keep things under storage. We have packages of wood that are setting up front here right now. Most of this is here due to us

not having room to store it. He stated that he has equipment from Minnesota that was delivered and is trying to get that moved back behind.

Mr. Pulver questioned what the building in the back was used for.

Mr. Holman stated that this is where the two kilns are located. The third kiln will be in the front building where the addition will be added on.

Mr. Carnahan stated that one of the concerns that he mentioned was the discharge of water. You had stated that water is sprayed on the wood and goes to the catch basins. How much water are you using at a time.

Mr. Holman stated that he's talking probably a couple thousand gallons of water a month at the most. That's with our softeners regenerating.

Mr. Pulver asked if that water will get recycled.

Mr. Holman stated no, most of the water will evaporate into steam. He added that most of the water comes from the softeners and what little water will come out of the kilns. The water runs through two settling tanks.

Mr. Yoder asked Carlyle to come back up to the podium. He asked if there was something in the I3 zoning district with these regulations or what's allowed in there that's causing a concern.

Carlyle stated that the noise deal is one of them being they can start at any time. This wasn't really a big concern for him. If they plan to start running around the clock there will be just that much more noise. With the extra help there're having to park in the yard on their property. It just doesn't look good to him.

Mrs. Holt asked what the noise impact would be. So, presuming that this new kiln is going to be similar.

Carlyle stated that they come outside to bring the lumber from the manufacturing plant to the warehouse and they also unload and load trucks. The trucks try to get there early in the morning. It's just that the back of our house is right there. He addressed that something just needs to be done. He knows that he's no longer a part of the operation. When they take their tarps off their trucks out front, they leave trash. The trash and the noise were really his main concerns. He stated that he just doesn't want the issues to get worse. He would like this to be addressed.

Mr. Carnahan asked if there were any further questions for Mr. Holman.

Mr. Yoder asked so if we rezone this then we can address the issues with the screening when they want to do a development.

Mr. Gaumer stated that they have already applied for the permit for the addition to the building. When there's an expansion of an existing building, we won't require them to go through a development plan process. There're no buffer requirements required for industrial zoning next to agricultural. You could require extra screening now. There's just not any room to do so where they're located.

Mr. Yoder stated that there could be if Carlyle and Arbor Wood agreed on some type of fence.

Mr. Gaumer stated that it couldn't be due to it having to be on Carlyle's property. The Plan Commission can't impose a condition on another property. This would have to be an agreement amongst them. The option is that it's legal non-conforming now. It's going to stay legal non-conforming even if the Commissioners deny the rezone.

Mr. Hartman asked what would happen if it was not rezoned.

Mr. Gaumer answered that it would remain a legal non-conforming use and can still operate. The standards would remain agricultural if they wanted to build or add on. There's not much to change, it's just a clean up of the property that's happened over the years.

Andrew Kruse stated that this should have been zoned I2 or I3 back in 2009.

Mr. Gaumer stated that yes it could have been. From what Mr. Holman stated the business wasn't as intense before and has grown since then.

Mrs. Harrison stated that they're trying to do the right thing now.

Mr. Carnahan stated that there should be a type of procedure to clean up legal non-conforming when the ownership changes.

Mr. Gaumer stated that there's no way to know when the ownership changes on any properties. The property owner would need to do this on their own.

Mr. Hartman stated that he has a problem with the I3. It's just a broad spectrum of usage that this will open. If they put this in and someone else comes in and buys it who knows what they will put in. With the house being so close, it's problematic in his mind. On the other side he knew that when he built his house so close, he realized that he might have to live with something he might not like.

Mr. Gaumer stated that the only problem with light manufacturing is that they would be against the ordinance with the noise and odors.

Mr. Pulver stated that another thing is that across 101 and to the north is I3. He wasn't sure why it's I3 to the north.

Mr. Holman stated that when we originally started Eco Vantage, we considered having a building running along the railroad tracks. The railroad tracks run along there and it's less than a quarter mile away. That's less noise than what we would probably make. He stated that they rezoned the property in hopes of bringing rail on there at some point. We just never grew how we wanted to then. It's just now that we have finally taken off and people have started to learn about this process, being new.

Mr. Pulver questioned the ground located on the east side of 101.

Mr. Holman stated that the ground located on the north side of CR 62 was one of the previous owners of Eco Vantage.

Mr. Pulver stated that this ground is zoned I3. That would be more of a concern if they wanted to move their business to that location. He added that we could add on the condition that if Arbor Wood moved it would revert to A2.

Mr. Gaumer stated that we could add a condition. We would just have to be aware when it sells to have it changed back to agricultural. He addressed that whatever district you place here except I3 it will be non-conforming. If you add a condition, you still wouldn't be addressing the problem. He stated an expansion of a business is good for DeKalb County. Part of this is how you would reconcile somebody that has a house directly next door. He added that at one point this was part of the previous business. He understands the increased truck traffic and trash.

Mr. Holman stated that this is all news to him, and he will try hard to keep the property clean. He's not sure what pictures were provided but he's in the process of cleaning up in front of the buildings. He addressed that he would like to not cause problems with the neighbors.

Mr. Van Wye added that we must remember that this is a new business in the area. It will take time to take care of some of the things that need to be moved.

Mrs. Davis stated that because there's no chemicals involved, she can see it growing. When there's no chemicals in the environment people would be for it.

Mr. Yoder stated that over the years he has used their products for decks. If you keep it sealed it will last for a long time.

Mr. Pulver asked what the County could do for the road from SR 101 to his driveway. If this is a dirt road and there's that many semis' coming and going.

Mr. Holman stated that you can't really do much. We will have about 14 semi's a month. This would be at minimum besides what deliveries we would receive. He added that the County does try to do a good job grating the road. With it being a dirt road, it gets worn out.

Mr. Yoder asked if the trucks that stage overnight could be on CR 62 instead. If the road was widened a little with a shoulder. This could be a better place than pulling in.

Mr. Holman stated that if it was widened, he would say so. He added that there is a decent amount of traffic that goes down CR 62. He added that he could request that trucks not stay overnight. The trucks will usually be there at about 2 a.m. and wait till about 5:30-6 when we get there.

Mr. Carnahan asked how often the trucks will stay there overnight.

Mr. Holman stated that it depends on the type of year. Usually from Spring to Fall a couple times a week overnight. They will probably run their motors or have a generator to have air conditioning. We can do our best to not have them unstrap out there. He stated that all he can do is try to address these issues.

Mr. Carnahan asked if there were any further comments or questions from the public. Hearing none. He closed the public portion of the hearing. He asked if there were any further questions amongst the board.

Mrs. Holt stated that she had some similar concerns about the road being a gravel road. We have received a non-objection letter from the Highway Department presuming that they had looked at it and had no concerns with the additional traffic.

Mr. Carnahan asked that we move onto the Findings of Fact.

Mr. Kruse read the Findings of Fact.

JURISDICTIONAL FINDINGS:

The petitioner has complied with the rules and regulations of the Plan Commission in filing appropriate forms and reports.

- 1. Application completed and filed on December 17, 2024
- 2. Legal notice published in The Star on January 3, 2025 and Publishers Affidavit received.
- 3. Certificate of mailing notices sent and receipts given to staff.
- 4. Non-Objection letter from the County Board of Health, dated December 20, 2024
- 5. Non-Objection letter from the County Highway Department, dated December 17, 2024
- 6. Non-Objection letter from the DeKalb County Soil & Water Conservation District, dated December 18, 2024
- 7. Non-Objection letter from the County Surveyor, dated December 17, 2024
- 8. Letter from the DeKalb County Airport Authority is not applicable.

UDO & STATUTORY MATTERS TO CONSIDER:

- 1. Is the change in zoning paying reasonable regard to the Comprehensive Plan?

 The subject area has a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Mixed Agricultural/Rural Residential. The proposed zoning district is not necessarily compatible with this FLU designation, but the designation does not limit the Zoning Districts that can be located within it.
- 2. Is the change in zoning paying reasonable regard to the current conditions and the character of current structures and uses in each district?
 The existing development surrounding the properties are industrial, agricultural and residential in use. This change in zoning will be consistent with the surrounding properties and the current conditions and character of current structures and land uses in the area.
- 3. Is the change in zoning paying reasonable regard to the most desirable use for which the land in each district is adapted?

The proposed zoning district is desirable for this property and the area.

- 4. Is the change in zoning paying reasonable regard to the conservation of property values throughout the jurisdiction?

 The property values of the area should not be disturbed negatively. Similar use has been at this property for several years.
- 5. Is the change in zoning paying reasonable regard to responsible development and growth? In changing the zoning of the properties to 13, High Intensity Industrial, the Plan Commission will be promoting the desired use of the land while promoting responsible development and growth.

IT IS, THEREFORE, THE DECISION OF THE PLAN COMMISSION THAT THIS ZONE MAP AMENDMENT, <u>PETITION #25-03</u> ARBOR WOOD REZONE, HEREBY CERTIFYING A <u>FAVORABLE RECOMMENDATION</u> TO THE COUNTY COMMISSIONERS ON THIS 15th DAY OF JANUARY 2025.

Motion made by: Suzanne Davis Seconded by: Sandra Harrison

Vote tally: Yes: 8 No: 1 (William Hartman)

Jason Carnahan

William Hartman

Tyler Lanning

Frank Pulver

Suzanne Davis

DeKalb 2040 – Comprehensive Plan Update:

Mr. Gaumer informed everyone that the first steering committee meeting was last Thursday the 9th. He stated that the meeting was scheduled for an hour and took about an hour and a half. He stated that anyone wanting to know what was discussed can review the uploaded presentation that was presented. It can be viewed on the dekalb2040.com website. He addressed that they had discussions on opportunities or challenges that they felt that DeKalb County faced. We discussed the demographics that would be associated with this review. The community was concerned that the data skewed more towards the municipalities because this Comprehensive Plan is more of just unincorporated DeKalb County. They wanted to see the information about the municipalities excluded. They thought that some of the demographics felt off. The survey results were addressed to what the steering committee had answered.

They're looking at doing focus groups in mid-February and another round in early March. He stated that everyone should keep a look out on the website or by email for frequent updates.

REPORTS FROM OFFICERS, COMMITTEES, STAFF OR TOWN/CITY LIAINSONS:

Mrs. Davis informed the board that the City of Auburn had their meeting. They addressed Dairy Queen's trash enclosure not meeting the approved plans. The Dairy Queen will have to wait till spring to lay the blocks to match the ordinance code. Rathburn leasing received approval for an 11,000 square foot canopy and gravel storage lot for boat and RV's. A Sonic restaurant was approved by Home Depot next to the proposed Mike's Carwash location.

Mike Makarewich stated that they will address the dumpster in the spring to be compliant with what was approved.

Mrs. Harrison informed the board that there was no meeting for the City of Butler.

Mr. Gaumer stated that the next meeting for Butler will be next Thursday at 6:30.

Mrs. Holt informed the board that there was no meeting for the City of Waterloo.

Mr. Pulver informed the board that there was no meeting for the City of Garrett.

COMMENTS/QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC IN ATTENDANCE:

None

ADJOURNMENT:

Jason Carnahan adjourned the meeting at 8:15 p.m.

President – Jason Carnahan

Secretary - Meredith Reith